

2016 NCFL Fall Director's Meeting  
September 23-24, 2016  
Louisville, KY

Meeting came to order at 5:30 p.m.

- Roll Call conducted
- Reports of the officers

**President, Roberta Hyland:** Update of Policy Debate Topic Selection Committee in Oklahoma

A. Five topics resulted from meeting:

- energy in environment
- domestic agriculture
- Russia
- Education
- Income Inequality

B. The Topic Committee is interested in having an international topic where the actor is not the US government (i.e., NATO, the International Governing Body, etc.); please give feedback on this issue to Roberta

C. If anyone is looking to write a topic for NHFS.org - put your name in to write a topic

D. Next year's topic meeting is in Orlando

E. The Dick Gaudette Award: Reminder - nominations due by January 31, 2017

- The award is to honor people who do good work on behalf of NCFL; and we need to establish a committee
- Past winners are posted on the NCFL.org website

**First VP, Barbara Fontenot:** We are looking for PF and LD topics for Nationals - please submit by January 10, 2017

- Please email suggestions to : [ldpf@ncfl.org](mailto:ldpf@ncfl.org)
- We need people interested in serving on the wording committee = please reach out to Roland, Roberta or Barbara by January 10, 2017

**Second VP, Susan Peebles:** There were 750 extemp questions submitted for Sacramento!

- For 2017: if you have topic area suggestions email to Susan by January 10, 2017 at [extemp@ncfl.org](mailto:extemp@ncfl.org)
- Schedule: the narrowed topic areas will be released by early-february and questions can be submitted by April 15, 2017

**Publicity Director, Ann Marie Duffy:** Please submit photos from events to me for our scrapbook

**Tournament Director, Roland Burdett:**

- Thank You from Sacramento!
- There were no mistakes or errors reported at the Tournament ... Thank You ALL
- Lessons Learned:
  1. We split the tournament across the convention center and regular buildings; this was a test, because in 2018 all events are at the convention center; Message from speech community = do not clap after every speech
  2. Power on the floor of the convention center for debate is very expensive (i.e., seven plugs in each cubicle for 200 cubicles = \$1500 per cubicle)
    - a. We should have passed the word better that there was no power. We apologize. NCFL will do better going forward.
    - b. NCFL is getting an estimate for power in 2018
    - c. How to Address - (a) do you want us to solicit money for these power drops?, etc. The Board is open to ideas
  3. Cross-talk on the floor: debaters got used to the cross talk
    - a. Is there a way to make drapes thicker? Yes, but it is much more expensive. It takes the bill for pipe-and-drape from \$75,000 to \$150,000.
  4. There is always something! There were unexpected costs at convention center at Sacramento and we will have to consider them when negotiating in the future
  5. Good things from Sacramento.
    - Buses were awesome (people and plan excellent)
    - The sites were great
    - The food trucks were smooth and easy
    - The early release of Student/Judge Codes - worked well this time
    - The App was a success!
      - We had 3000 downloads (75% of people at tournament downloaded App)
      - Question for the Directors: do we still want the paper programs?
    - Speech Wire - we used in Student Congress for first time and it worked well
    - Tabroom - we used in all Debates and it worked well

**Financial Statement, Mike Colletti:** Sacramento was an expensive tournament

- The overages were: (a) site charges; (2) web internet; and (3) hospitality
- Registrations this year were down; perhaps distance was a factor
- Memberships were down from previous year
- We did receive a rebate from ConferenceDirect, which helped bring us back
- Our block sur-charge went down, which means less people stayed outside of block
  - How comfortable are we with expenses and future nationals:

- Mike Colletti= this coming year, we should be ok and we should be in budget; DC should be ok because we are not busing; we predict we will be ok in Milwaukee and Chicago. Trying to eliminate buses in Chicago.
- Part of problem was the hybrid convention center & schools approach. We were \$50k over budget and that was the cost of the buses to the schools.
- Roland Burdett (Arlington)- food was also very expensive; we may revert to giving \$20 to each Tab Staff / Judges for breakfast and lunch. It's much cheaper!

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the budget was accepted

### Update from Louisville

- Density Monahan - From Convention Center and Visitors Bureau: Welcome; Reminder: if you fill your Bourbon Trail passport and take it to the Visitor's Bureau - you will get a gift
- Katy Cecil - welcome & Presentation
  - Very drivable destination with a major airport
  - Attractions: Derby Dinner Playhouse (Indiana); Breakout Louisville (room escape); Mega Caverns; Belle of Louisville (river tour); Louisville Zoo; Big 4 Bridge; 4th Street Live; Kentucky Kingdom (water park will be open Memorial Day); Louisville Slugger Field; Kentucky Derby Museum; Churchill Downs; Ali Center; Slugger Museum; Speed Art Museum (free on Sundays); Frazier Museum
  - Over 150 restaurants in downtown
  - Venues:
    - Trinity High School = PF
    - Assumption HS = LD
    - Central HS = Policy
    - Noe Middle & duPont Manual High School = 3 Speech events
    - University of Louisville = 3 Speech events
  - Mass will be at the Galt House, in the Ballroom; Archbishop Joseph Kurtz will preside (former Speech competitor)
  - The Posting Party will be Galt House in the ballroom (Steve the Bugler from Kentucky Derby will be there for posting)
  - Tournament Headquarters is at the Galt House
    - \$145 Double/Double & Kings
    - \$165 suites (can sleep 5)
    - 800+ rooms at this hotel
    - Sunday debate and
    - Congress here Saturday
    - Registration, Mass and Awards all here
      - Note that the tax rate is about 14%
  - Louisville Marriott \$169 (Double/Double & Kings)

- Hyatt Regency \$165 (Double/Doubles & Kings)
- Courtyard Marriott Downtown \$156 DD/Kings
- Hampton Inn \$159 DD/Kings
- Fairfield Inn \$159 DD/Kings
- Springhill Suites \$169 DD/Kings
- Transportation - by Miller Transportation on Saturday (all locations); no buses needed on Sunday

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the meeting was adjourned until 8:30 a.m. Saturday, September 24, 2016

Saturday Morning, September 24, 2016  
Meeting was called to order at 8:30 a.m.

### **Bylaws changes**

#### 1. Article II, Section B.1.A. - Wild Card entry

- Charlie Sloat - Presenting the proposed Amendment
  - Every year the board is faced with requests from dioceses re mistakes and requests for “Bobby” or “Jane” to please get an extra slot at Nationals; so this is a proposed compromised solution
  - We don’t want to make this a “review” process. The Board does not want to check and determine whether the request rises to any specific “level,” etc.
  - This is meant to be harsh and draconian, it’s use is discouraged
  - This is not something a league can take advantage of; they have to make hard decisions and they only get one every four years
- Question = there are no parameters that have to be met, right? There is no explanation required, correct? Yes
- Question = Why is there a quota of at least one entry per category? Did not want a small home school with one entry to get just a second kid
- Discussion of whether this allows local leagues to send an extra entry too easily.
- Discussion of the impact of all leagues were to do it at once, or in one event.
- Discussion of the the flexibility this affords directors to resolve an egregious error.

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the ByLaws amendment passes on a voice vote

#### 2. Article II, Section C, 4.b. (Run-off Round)

- Steve Medoff (Philadelphia) - There were a number of 4-1s in Lincoln-Douglas & Public Forum debate that were not clearing to Double Octos and wanted to see if there was a way to add a run-off round
- Roland Burdett (Arlington): last year in LD debate, there were nine (9) teams with 4-1 records that did not clear; in 2015 - eleven (11) teams with 4-1 records in LD did not clear; in PF, twelve (12) teams last year did not clear and in 2015, thirteen (13) teams did not clear; with this proposal, we would put those kids who did not clear in rounds with kids who did clear, so all 4-1 records are at risk with this play-in round
- Discussion of the timing of the rounds: Saturday night or Sunday morning. Holding it on Saturday night, so students, judges and coaches would have to stay, they would miss mass, be late for dinner, and it would increase our bussing costs. Preference is to do it on Sunday morning, though that requires more rooms.
- Discussion of the fairness across events. There's always a cut line and students miss it ... in debate, in speech.
- Discussion of the judge pool required.
- Discussion of whether the rounds could be held via internet to alleviate room concerns.
- Discussion of the "risk" this puts a higher seed at. There is a difference between 4-1 with 10 ballots and 4-1 with 8 ballots; lots of trouble if 8 ballots takes out 10 on Sunday morning play-in round.

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the ByLaws amendment passes on a roll call vote 75 to 59

### 3. Article II, Section C. 1. a. (3) Declamation, etc. to disqualify kneeling

- Jim Reagan (Newark) - Duo is only category in which if you kneel you are disqualified, so for equity we wanted this added to all speech events
- Discussion on some of the evolution of events. We saw everything from splits to handstands and in prose and poetry we see kneeling on the floor; we need to firm this up and put everyone on equal playing field
- From the protest committee point of view; we want to see the kids performing, i like the way this clears it up and all know where "they stand"

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the ByLaws amendment passes on a voice vote

### 4. Article II, Section C.1.. Oral Interp (Binder as prop)

- Greg Cunningham (Boston): The Protest Committee is begging for this change; this allows for this issue to be judges preference and interpretation and not a disqualifiable issue

- The Protest Committee is just trying to clear up something this is hair splitting; makes sense to leave it to judge discretion. It is heartbreaking to kick out a kid when the kid says they did not make gesture or didn't make gesture they are accused of; a third of the protests were about binders
- Discussion of the use of props and that this allows one event to use one. there is inconsistency here - if no props at all, but now binders might be used; "should" is too undefined - either allowed or not allowed
- Steve Sexton (Milwaukee): proposed amendment "No properties except a manuscript or binder may be used"
- Greg Cunningham (Boston): seconded the amendment

Speaking to amendment:

- Dave Long (Allentown): clarification - is there another rule that says you have to use a manuscript?
- Steve Sexton (Milwaukee): yes
- Kelly Midgely (Baltimore): once you say it can be used as a prop - what is requirement now for "reading"
- Jason Robinson (Cincinnati): personal perspective, this is not an issue

Upon a motion duly made and seconded, the amendment to the amendment passes, on a hand vote

Discussion resumed on the amendment to the Bylaws

- Discussion of judge's discretion. Whether reading or using prop - this leaves it in the judge's hands; as long as judges are following rules
- Final note before the vote: we have polarized the discussion; should you vote against this - we are back to throwing kids out for using binder as prop

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the ByLaws amendment passes on a voice vote

#### 5. Article II, Section C.1.b. (3) DP, etc. (Mimicry)

- Susan Peebles (Erie): we have a problem where the kids are mimicking videos; we have this rule in Erie and has been working well
- Discussion of how do we enforce this? sometimes scripts calls for certain actions - is that mimicking? puts the Protest Committee in an impossible position; great sentiment; maybe say we discourage or look down on, but let's not make it a rule
- But when it happens, it's horrible and it should not be happening; problem with this is the "sounds effects" and "movements" - there are just some things that can't be done differently; and also we can't enforce
- Discussion of what's the threshold ... how much is enough for copying?

- This is an interpretation issue, but how do you police?

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the ByLaws amendment failed, on a voice vote

A break was taken at 10:15 a.m.

The meeting resumed at 10:20 a.m.

#### 6. Student Congress Manual Amendment, Section IV, Para 6

- Mike Vigars: We allowed for two presiding officers in final session; but we did not put in how we elected the two presiding officers - so we defined the procedure here
- Mike Vigars: recency does not reset; so one speech per hour, so this puts them at two speeches per hour potentially
- This worked last year? No one complained

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the ByLaws amendment passes on a voice vote

#### 7. Student Congress Manual Amendment, Section V, Para 7

- Mike Vigars: Parliamentary Vote
- Roland Burdett (Arlington): to clarify: clearing to finals from semis - 8 kids; changes to = 5 by judges, 2 students, 1 by Parliamentarian
- Mike Vigars: need amendment to change "semi finalist" to finalist = friendly amendment

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the ByLaws amendment passes on a voice vote

#### 8. Article II, Section D, 8. Disqualification & Protests

- Roland Burdett (Arlington): background and explanation
- Discussion of the timing of protests and appeals
- Roland Burdett (Arlington): agrees to friendly amendment to clarify timing is different on Saturday and Sunday because of Elims. Diocesan director can notify protest committee (but only judges/coaches can challenge a piece)
- Discussion of what's been the practice in the past. This just codifies what we've been trying to do.
- With respect to timing, on Saturday we're willing to be flexible for reasonable reasons, but we can't on Sunday and still have awards on time.
- Roland Burdett (Arlington): "within 90 mins of conclusion of prelim or 30 mins of conclusion of elimination round" = friendly amendment accepted

- Discussion of Tab Staff initiating a challenges. There is a consensus in the room over the years that Tab Staff knows what pieces are in the right category, etc. The example is that someone always does the “Raven” as prose, but gets through judges, etc. that was an obvious issue the Tab Room could have corrected

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the ByLaws amendment passes on a voice vote

9. NCFL’s Instructions to Bidders, Section 1, new para 3 (Fall Meeting Sites)

- Allows a league hosting Nationals to offer to host the Fall Meeting prior to Nationals when they submit the Bid. No longer required to wait until May of the year of the Fall Meeting. This makes it easier to negotiate hotel contracts.

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the ByLaws amendment passes on a voice vote

**Discussion Items:**

- Exec Board will review Student Congress Manual to “clean it up” at Winter Meeting
- Whether the changes will take effect in Louisville will depend on the number of “changes”

**New Business:**

- The Board is accepting new bids; the next available year to host Nationals is 2021; please see Roland Burdett or Sarah Donnelly
- Catherine Luhr (Buffalo): can we organize a service element between kids and adults in each community during Nationals; can we have an element in our tournaments where we give back? Past Presidents spearhead this project. Catherine will lead it - all who want to be a part - work with Catherine

Upon a motion duly made and seconded the meeting was adjourned.